

**THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS OF THE COUNTY OF STANISLAUS  
BOARD ACTION SUMMARY**

DEPT: Public Works

BOARD AGENDA:5.C.1  
AGENDA DATE: August 21, 2018

**SUBJECT:**

Approval to Set a Public Hearing for the September 25, 2018, Meeting to Introduce and Waive the First Reading of an Ordinance to Amend Existing Transit Fares for the Stanislaus Regional Transit System (StaRT)

**BOARD ACTION AS FOLLOWS:**

**RESOLUTION NO. 2018-0419**

On motion of Supervisor Olsen, Seconded by Supervisor Withrow  
and approved by the following vote,

Ayes: Supervisors: Olsen, Chiesa, Withrow, Monteith, and Chairman DeMartini


Noes: Supervisors: None

Excused or Absent: Supervisors: None

Abstaining: Supervisor: None

- 1)  Approved as recommended
- 2)  Denied
- 3)  Approved as amended
- 4)  Other:

**MOTION:**

ATTEST:   
ELIZABETH A. KING, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

File No. ORD-56-D-1

**THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS OF THE COUNTY OF STANISLAUS  
AGENDA ITEM**

DEPT: Public Works

BOARD AGENDA:5.C.1  
AGENDA DATE: August 21, 2018

CONSENT:

CEO CONCURRENCE:

4/5 Vote Required: No

---

**SUBJECT:**

Approval to Set a Public Hearing for the September 25, 2018, Meeting to Introduce and Waive the First Reading of an Ordinance to Amend Existing Transit Fares for the Stanislaus Regional Transit System (StaRT)

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. Set a public hearing for September 25, 2018 meeting to introduce and waive the first reading of an ordinance to amend existing transit fares for Stanislaus Regional Transit (StaRT).
2. Direct the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors to publish notices of such hearing pursuant to Section 66018 of the Government Code.

**DISCUSSION:**

The Public Works Transit Division oversees the operations of the Stanislaus Regional Transit System (StaRT) within Stanislaus County, including fixed route, Dial-A-Ride, Shuttle, Commuter, the American with Disabilities Act (ADA) Paratransit and non-emergency medical transportation services. As part of its responsibilities, the Division evaluates existing transit services and recommends changes to the fare structure as needed.

Existing law imposes certain financial requirements on transit operators making claims for transit funds, including requirements that fare revenue collected by the operator cover a specified percentage of operating costs. The specified percentage of operating costs is known as the farebox recovery ratio (FRR). The FRR is difficult to meet due to increasing costs outpacing revenues.

Legislative committees are working on implementing a statewide fix to the FRR. In the interim, Senate Bill 903 (SB903), a temporary 2-year reprieve, was approved by the Governor on July 16, 2018. The bill authorizes Stanislaus Council of Governments (StanCOG), that when determining if specified operators have met the requirements for claims of transit funds for the 2018-2019 and 2019-2020 fiscal years, to reduce the applicable ratio of fare revenues to operating cost for specified operators by up to five percentage points from the ratio that was effective during the 2015-2016 fiscal year. The bill also requires StanCOG to submit a report to the transportation policy committee of each house of the Legislature and to the Department of Transportation analyzing the options for organizing and supporting transit service in the county.

Fiscal Year 2016-2017 was the first year that Stanislaus County Transit did not meet the FRR. The required FRR for Fiscal Year 2016-2017 was 15%, and StaRT's FRR was 10.93%, which included allowable exemptions for new services. Per the Transportation Development Act (TDA) requirements, Fiscal Year 2016-2017 was considered a "Grace Year" for StaRT. The FRR for Fiscal Year 2017-2018 is estimated to be 14% with the allowable exemptions. This will result in a second year of not meeting FRR and will be considered a non-compliance year. This non-compliance year would have caused Fiscal Year 2018-2019 to be a determination year and payment of penalty in Fiscal Year 2019-2020, if SB903 had not been passed.

The projected FRR for Fiscal Year 2018-2019 is estimated to be 14% with allowable exemptions that are due to expire at the end of the fiscal year. The recommended fare increase is necessary to get to a projected FRR of 15%. The projections also takes into account, Measure L income, and Low Carbon Transit Operations Program (LCTOP) funds which directly contribute to the farebox ratio. The loss of the proposed fare increase, as well as any of these revenue sources, would result in a decrease in the current year's FRR projection.

The requirement to request a reduction in StaRT's FRR would be a presentation to the StanCOG Policy Board outlining the actions that were taken for the fiscal year that reduction assistance is being requested, in addition to future improvements to meet the FRR. StanCOG would then be able to authorize a true up between the requirement and the difference of our actual FRR for that particular fiscal year.

Fiscal Year	Farebox Ratio Requirement	FRR without Exemptions	FRR with Exemptions <sup>1</sup>
2016-2017	15%	9.63%	10.93%
2017-2018	15%	13% (Estimate pending year-end close)	14% (Estimate pending year-end close)
2018-2019	(15%) 10% with SB903 and StanCOG's authorization	12% (Estimated)	15% (Estimated)

1. Exemptions are allowed for new service and/or expansion of service, e.g. adding a new bus route.

The consequences in failing to comply with the FRR is the prohibited use of Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds for operations. TDA law does provide for exemptions if an operator attempts to improve FRRs (PUC 99268.8 and 99268.9) by encouraging ridership. No exemptions are provided for service cuts. A grace period is provided in the instance that an operator's exemptions have been exhausted. Penalties for failing to comply with FRR become more punitive with each year that operators are non-compliant.

Annually, in preparation for the Proposed Transit Division budget, staff evaluates transit operational costs and associated transit fares to ensure compliance with Federal and State-mandated requirements. This process includes reviewing new Federal Transit Administration (FTA) regulations as well as ensuring compliance with the State-mandated farebox ratio requirements. To meet Federal and State requirements, staff considers new or additional fees where appropriate, as well as modification of existing fees, in order to cover increased operational costs. StaRT has taken action in an attempt to prevent the anticipated FRR non-compliance by reducing low performing routes, increasing marketing efforts and technology, and planning projects to reduce costs in order to increase ridership.

Modifications to existing fares include increases to the following services: StaRT Fixed Route, Shuttle, Dial-A-Ride, Medivan, and ADA Complementary Paratransit Services. The Fixed Route Stop services include Routes 10, 15, 40, 45 East, 45 West, 60, and 61. The Intercity Curb-to-Curb Shuttle service includes the Turlock/Modesto Shuttle, Waterford/Modesto/Ceres Shuttle and Eastside Shuttle. The Intracity Dial-a-Ride services category is for local Curb-to-Curb Dial-a-Rides and includes Patterson, Newman, Riverbank and Oakdale Dial-a-Rides. The Medivan service is the County's non-emergency medical transportation service to Bay Area medical facilities. The ADA Complementary Paratransit Service provides demand-response transportation service for passengers who cannot use the fixed-route service due to a disability.

If adopted, passengers will see increases to StaRT cash fares, bus cards and passes, and Medivan services (Exhibit A). The proposed increases range from \$0.10 to \$0.60 for cash fares and \$0.30 to \$4.00 for bus cards/passes to the Fixed Route, Shuttle, and Dial-A-Ride services. The \$0.60 fare increase is due to the high cost in providing ADA paratransit service throughout the county. Medivan services will see an increase of \$1.50 for passengers and \$1 for attendants. As shown in Exhibit B, the StaRT fare structure will continue to be lower than Merced County intercity fares and cities of Modesto and Ripon intracity fares. The Transit Division must follow a public participation plan to adhere to Federal Transit Administration (FTA) requirements for any fare increases. The following is the list of public information meetings held regarding the fare increases:

- |   |                          |                                       |               |
|---|--------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------|
| 1 | Oakdale Community Center | 110 S. 2 <sup>nd</sup> Ave, Oakdale   | June 8, 2018  |
| 2 | Patterson City Hall      | Plaza 1, Patterson                    | June 26, 2018 |
| 3 | City/County Building     | 1010 10 <sup>th</sup> Street, Modesto | June 27, 2018 |
| 4 | Oakdale Senior Center    | 450 E. A Street, Oakdale              | June 29, 2018 |

Information regarding the proposed fees is posted on all StaRT buses throughout the County as well as publications in the Oakdale Leader, Riverbank News, Turlock Journal, Ceres Courier, West Side Index, and Gustine Press. The information is also posted on the Public Works Transit website at [www.srt.org](http://www.srt.org), its Facebook pages, and email notifications were sent to multiple agencies throughout Stanislaus County.

**POLICY ISSUE:**

Prior to amending existing fares, the County is required under Government Code Section 66018 et seq., to hold a scheduled public hearing as part of a regularly scheduled meeting of the Board of Supervisors. At that time, the Board of Supervisor’s may introduce and waive the first reading of an ordinance to establish new and amend existing fees of the Department of Public Works Transit System. The Board of Supervisors’ approval of the proposed fare structure is required under Section 99400 of the Public Utility Code and complies with the FTA Half-Fare Policy under 49 U.S.C. Chapter 53; 49 CFR 609.23 and FTA C. 9030.1E.

**FISCAL IMPACT:**

If the proposed fare adjustments are approved, the amended fees will become effective November 1, 2018. An increase in revenue for the Department of Public Works Transit Division is estimated to be approximately \$65,000 in Fiscal Year 2018-2019. The recommended fee revenue will be adjusted in the Fiscal Year 2018-2019 Mid-Year Public Works Transit Budget.

**BOARD OF SUPERVISORS’ PRIORITY:**

The recommended actions are consistent with the Boards’ priority of *Delivering Efficient Public Services and Community Infrastructure* by ensuring the County’s public transit system remains in compliance with State and Federal law through this proposed fare increase needed to sustain transit services.

**STAFFING IMPACT:**

Existing Public Works staff will support these recommended actions.

**CONTACT PERSON:**

David Leamon, Interim Public Works Director  
Annette Borrelli, Transit Manager

Telephone: 209 525-4153  
Telephone: 209 525-7569

**ATTACHMENT(S):**

1. Ordinance Amending Existing Fares 2018
2. Exhibit A - Proposed 2018 StaRT Fares
3. Exhibit B - Fare Comparisons

ORDINANCE NO. C.S \_\_\_\_\_

**AN ORDINANCE RELATING TO FARES FOR TRANSIT SERVICE**

THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS OF THE COUNTY OF STANISLAUS ORDAINS AS FOLLOWS:

**Section 1.** Fares for transit services provided by Stanislaus Regional Transit ("StaRT") are amended and adopted as set forth in Exhibit "A" attached hereto.

**Section 2.** This ordinance shall take effect thrity (30) days from and after the date of its passage and before the expiration of fifteen (15) days after its passage it shall be published once, with the names of the members voting for and against the same, in the Modesto Bee, a newspaper published in the County of Stanislaus, State of California.

Upon Motion of Supervisor \_\_\_\_\_, seconded by Supervisor \_\_\_\_\_, the foregoing ordinance was passed and adopted at a regular meeting of the Board of Supervisors of the County of Stanislaus, State of California, this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2018, by the following called vote.

AYES: Supervisors:

NOES: Supervisors:

ABSENT: Supervisors:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jim DeMartini  
Chairman of the Board of Supervisors  
of the County of Stanislaus, State of  
California

**ATTEST:**  
Elizabeth King, Clerk of the Board of  
Supervisors of the County of Stanislaus,  
State of California

By \_\_\_\_\_  
Deputy Clerk

JOHN DOERING  
County Counsel

By  \_\_\_\_\_  
~~Amanda DeHart~~ *Thomas E. Bo*  
~~Deputy County Counsel~~  
*Assistant*

## EXHIBIT A

The proposed changes to the current fare structure are:

<b>Fixed Stop Service (Fixed Route)</b>	<b>Existing</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Increase</b>
<b>Cash Fare (one ride)</b>			
General Fare	\$1.60	\$1.80	\$0.20
Youth	\$1.50	Disc.	N/A
College	\$1.60	Disc.	N/A
Student	N/A	\$1.80	N/A
Senior/Disabled	\$0.80	\$0.90	\$0.10
<b>1-Day Bus Pass (StaRT to StaRT Transfer included in Bus Card)</b>			
General Fare	\$3.25	\$3.80	\$0.55
Youth	\$3.00	Disc.	N/A
College	\$3.25	Disc.	N/A
Student	N/A	\$3.60	N/A
Senior/Disabled	\$1.60	\$1.90	\$0.30
<b>20-Ride Pass</b>			
General Fare	\$28.00	\$32.00	\$4.00
Youth	\$25.50	Disc.	N/A
College	\$26.00	Disc.	N/A
Student	N/A	\$30.00	N/A
Senior/Disabled	\$14.00	\$16.00	\$2.00
<b>31-Day Pass (StaRT to StaRT Transfer included in Bus Card)</b>			
General Fare	\$48.00	\$52.00	\$4.00
Youth	\$42.00	Disc.	N/A
College	\$46.00	Disc.	N/A
Student	N/A	\$48.00	N/A
Senior Disabled	\$24.00	\$26.00	\$2.00
<b>Shuttle Intercity Dial-a-Ride Service (Curb-to-Curb)</b>	<b>Existing</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Increase</b>
<b>Cash Fare (one ride)</b>			
General Fare	\$2.75	\$3.00	\$0.25
Youth	\$2.75	Disc.	N/A
College	\$2.75	Disc.	N/A
Student	N/A	\$3.00	N/A
Senior/Disabled	\$2.25	\$2.50	\$0.25
 Outside Service Area	 \$1.50 plus Regular Fare	 \$1.50 plus Regular Fare	 Unchanged

<b>Intracity Dial-a-Ride Service (Curb-to-Curb)</b>	<b>Existing</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Increase</b>
Cash Fare (one ride)			
General Fare	\$1.75	\$2.00	\$0.25
Youth	\$1.50	Disc.	N/A
College	\$1.75	Disc.	N/A
Student	N/A	\$1.75	N/A
Senior Disabled	\$1.25	\$1.50	\$0.25
Outside Service Area	\$1.50 plus Regular Fare	\$1.50 plus Regular Fare	Unchanged
<b>ADA Intercity Service (Door-to-Door)</b>			
Passenger/Companion	\$3.00	\$3.60	\$0.60
<b>Medivan (Bay Area Medical Facilities)</b>			
One-Way Ride	\$11.00	\$12.50	\$1.50
Attendant	\$ 4.00	\$ 5.00	\$1.00
<b>Bart Commuter</b>			
One-Way Ride	\$13.00	\$13.00	Unchanged
Round Trip	\$16.00	\$16.00	Unchanged
Monthly Pass	\$170.00	\$170.00	Unchanged
<b>Intrasystem Transfers</b>			
	Free	Disc.	N/A
<b>Intersystem Transfers</b>			
	\$0.25	\$0.25	Unchanged



**Exhibit B - Page 1**

**CASH FARE COMPARISONS**

AI Fares are One - Way	StaRT (Proposed Fares)	Modesto	Turlock	Ceres	Ripon	San Joaquin County	Merced County	
Fare Type	Intercity	(Intracity)	(Intracity)	(Intracity)	(Intracity)	(Intercity)	(Intercity)	
<b>FIXED STOP SERVICE</b>								
General Fare	\$1.80	\$2.00	\$1.50	\$1.50	\$2.00	\$1.50	\$1.50 - \$3.00 (1)	General Public
Senior	\$0.90	\$1.00	\$0.75	\$1.50	\$1.00	\$0.75	\$ N/C - \$3.00 (1)(2)	Senior
Person w/Disability	\$0.90	\$1.00	\$0.75	\$1.50	\$1.00	\$0.75	\$1.50 - \$3.00 (1)	Person w/Disability
Student	\$1.80	\$1.50	\$1.50	\$1.50	\$1.00	\$1.50	\$1.50 - \$3.00 (1)	Student
<b>SHUTTLE / INTERCITY DIAL-A-RIDE (Curb-to-curb) SERVICE</b>								
General Fare	\$3.00	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$3.00	\$6.00	General Public
Senior	\$2.50	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$3.00	\$6.00	Senior
Person w/Disability	\$2.50	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$3.00	\$6.00	Person w/Disability
Student	\$3.00	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$3.00	\$6.00	Student
Zone Fare *	\$1.50 plus regular fare	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	
<b>INTRACITY DIAL-A-RIDE (Curb-to-Curb) SERVICE</b>								
General Fare	\$2.00	\$3.00 after 6:00 pm	\$3.50	\$3.00	\$4.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	General Public
Senior	\$1.50	\$3.00	\$2.50	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	Senior
Person w/Disability	\$1.50	\$3.00	\$2.50	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	Person w/Disability
Student	\$1.75	\$3.00 after 6:00 pm	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$4.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	Student
Zone Fare *	\$1.50 plus regular fare	NA	NA	NA	N/A	\$1.00 plus regular fare	N/A	
<b>ADA (Door-to-Door) SERVICE</b>								
ADA Passenger/Companion	\$3.60	\$3.00	\$2.50	N/A	N/A	\$3.00	\$3.00 - \$6.00 *	ADA Passenger/Companion
<b>MEDIVAN (Bay Area Medical Facility) SERVICE</b>								
All Passengers	\$12.50 One-Way Trip	NA	NA	NA	N/A	NA	NA	
All Passengers	Attendants \$5.00 each way	NA	NA	NA	N/A	NA	NA	

**NOTE:** (1) Zone fare is charged for service outside the normal service area. (2) Measure V provides Free Ride to Seniors, Veterans & ADA Eligible Passengers with ID.

**Various fare discounts are available from all operators through the use of passes, bus cards or ticket books**

**Exhibit B - Page 2**

**CARD & PASS COMPARISON**

	Start (Proposed Fares)			Modesto			Turlock		
	(Intercity)								
General Fare	20 Ride Card - \$30.00	1 Day Pass - \$3.80	31 Day Pass - \$52.00	50 Ticket Book - \$100.00	1 day Pass - \$4.00	31 Day Pass - \$58.00	20 ticket book -\$25.00	1 day Pass - \$3.50	31 Day Pass - \$50.00
Senior	20 Ride Card - \$15.00	1 Day Pass - \$1.60	31 Day Pass - \$26.00	50 Ticket Book - \$50.00	1 day Pass - \$4.00	31 Day Pass - \$29.00	20 ticket book -\$12.00	1 day Pass - \$1.75	31 Day Pass - \$25.00
Person w/Disability	20 Ride Card - \$15.00	1 Day Pass - \$1.60	31 Day Pass - \$26.00	50 Ticket Book - \$50.00	1 day Pass - \$4.00	31 Day Pass - \$29.00	20 ticket book -\$12.00	1 day Pass - \$1.75	31 Day Pass - \$25.00
Student	20 Ride Card - \$28.00	1 Day Pass - \$3.60	31 Day Pass - \$48.00	50 Ticket Book - \$75.00	1 day Pass - \$4.00	31 Day Pass - \$48.00	20 ticket book -\$25.00	1 day Pass - \$3.50	31 Day Pass - \$40.00

	Ceres		San Joaquin County		Merced County - "The Bus"		
General Fare	10 ride card - \$15.00	31 day pass - \$39.00	1 day Pass - \$4.00	31 Day Pass - \$85.00	31 day pass - \$60.00	Day pass - \$3.00 - \$6.00	General Public
Senior	N/A	N/A	1 day Pass - \$2.00	31 Day Pass - \$30.00	31 day pass - Free	Day pass - Free	Senior
Person w/Disability	N/A	N/A	1 day Pass - \$2.00	31 Day Pass - \$30.00	31 day pass - Free	Day pass - Free	Person w/Disability
Student	N/A	N/A	1 day Pass - \$4.00	31 Day Pass - \$40.00	31 day pass - \$45.00	Day pass - \$3.00 - \$6.00	Student

**Note: (1) Day & (31) Day passes include Start to Start transfers**

## NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that on September 25, 2018, 9:00 a.m., or soon thereafter, the matter may be heard, the Stanislaus County Board of Supervisors will meet in the Basement Chambers, Lower Level, 1010 10th St., Modesto, CA, to introduce and waive the first reading of an ordinance to amend existing fees for the Public Works Transit Division.

ADDITIONAL NOTICE IS GIVEN that the Public Works Transit Division 2018 Fee Schedule will be available for review on September 14, 2018, in the Clerk of the Board Office, 1010 10th Street, Suite 6500, Modesto, CA.

NOTICE IS FURTHER GIVEN that at the said time and place, interested persons will be given the opportunity to be heard. Material submitted to the Board for consideration (i.e. photos, petitions, etc.) will be retained by the County. If a challenge to the above ordinance is made in court, persons may be limited to raising only those issues they or someone else raised at the public hearing described in this notice, or in written correspondence delivered to the Board of Supervisors. For further information, contact Annette Borrelli at (209) 525-7569, [aborelli@stancounty.com](mailto:aborelli@stancounty.com) or visit the office at 1010 10<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 4204, Modesto, CA between the hours of 8:30 a.m. and 4:30 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

DATED: August 21, 2018

ATTEST: Elizabeth A. King, Clerk of  
the Board of Supervisors  
of the County of Stanislaus,  
State of California

BY:   
Pamela Villarreal, Assistant Clerk